

|                 | scoring weight | Low                                                                                                | Between Low and Medium                                                               | Medium                                                                                  | Between Medium and High                                                                            | High                                                                                                        |
|-----------------|----------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Originality     | 8              | 1<br>This confirms existing understanding.                                                         | 2<br>The originality is marginal.                                                    | 3<br>This enhances current understanding by introducing new exceptions or implications. | 4<br>The paper demonstrates relatively high originality in theory and/or practice.                 | 5<br>This is potentially seminal work, creating a new focus for inquiry.                                    |
| Equity          | 8              | 1<br>This submission has little or no bearing on social justice, equity, or anti-racism.           | 2<br>The submission pays slight attention to questions of social justice and equity. | 3<br>This submission could be applied in ways that advance social justice and equity.   | 4<br>The paper has demonstrated a relatively high level of social justice, equity, or anti-racism. | 5<br>This research makes significant progress in bringing experiential learning to underserved populations. |
| Transferability | 8              | 1<br>It's hard to tell how this research could be applied in settings other than the original one. | 2<br>The research has relatively low level of transferability.                       | 3<br>This research applies to a subset of higher education settings.                    | 4<br>The paper can be generalized in a broader field.                                              | 5<br>Readers in any higher education setting would find this research useful.                               |
| Topicality      | 7              | 1<br>Any connection to the editors' Topics of Current Interest is indirect.                        | 2<br>The connection to the editors' topics of current interest is marginal.          | 3<br>One or more parts of this work touch on Topics of Current Interest.                | 4<br>The paper relates to the editors' topics of current interest of this journal.                 | 5<br>The submission directly addresses one or more Topics of Current Interest.                              |

|                       | scoring weight | Low                                                                                                                                   | Between Low and Medium                                                               | Medium                                                                                                                                       | Between Medium and High                                                                                     | High                                                                                                                                       |
|-----------------------|----------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Scholarship           | 7              | 1<br>The submission demonstrates little awareness of existing literature or scholarly inquiry in the field of experiential education. | 2<br>The submission shows some familiarity with the field of experiential education. | 3<br>The submission's quality of scholarship is uneven but can be developed with editorial help.                                             | 4<br>The paper demonstrates some command of current relevant scholarship.                                   | 5<br>The submission demonstrates solid understanding of the field of experiential education, and draws on diverse perspectives and voices. |
| Methodology           | 7              | 1<br>Little rigor or consistency was applied to the research or scholarly inquiry, making it hard to validate.                        | 2<br>Some quality research methods were applied, but with little consistency.        | 3<br>The submission pays enough attention to methodology and/or scholarly inquiry to make its findings credible.                             | 4<br>The methods used can be verified and justified in a relatively high level.                             | 5<br>Research methods and/or scholarly inquiry are clear and rigorous, making this a good example for advancing the field.                 |
| Multi-modal potential | 4              | 1<br>This works as a printed article, but doesn't lend itself to other forms of delivery.                                             | 2<br>With some reworking these ideas could be presented in ways other than print.    | 3<br>The material presented here would also work as a podcast, conference presentation, or other traditional format for sharing scholarship. | 4<br>These ideas could be well communicated across multiple platforms, including social networks and video. | 5<br>The contributors have already created other media to communicate these ideas.                                                         |

|             | scoring weight | Low                                                                                                                                       | Between Low and Medium                                                              | Medium                                                                                                                                                                   | Between Medium and High                                                                    | High                                                                                                                                  |
|-------------|----------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Readability | 3              | <p>1</p> <p>Editors will need to work closely with the author(s) to improve the writing quality and accessibility in this submission.</p> | <p>2</p> <p>The paper has a structure but is not very clear and easy to follow.</p> | <p>3</p> <p>The submission is typical of first drafts: the reasoning and language are clear enough for evaluation, but with some lapses in logic, diction, or usage.</p> | <p>4</p> <p>The paper is easy to follow and demonstrates a relatively clear structure.</p> | <p>5</p> <p>The writing quality is unusually strong for a first draft, and approachable and accessible. Little editing is needed.</p> |